

THE REITH LECTURES

LECTURE 3: FREEDOM

REITH LECTURER: ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER

First broadcast on BBC Radio 4 at 9am on Tuesday 20 September 2011.

Explore over 60 years of Reith Lectures by downloading the Reith Lectures Archive podcasts and lecture transcripts via the BBC Radio 4 website: <http://www.bbc.co.uk/reithlectures>

EDWARD STOURTON: Welcome to the last of the 2011 BBC Reith Lectures. We are in the British Library in London, and this great 1..... of ideas is a fitting place to end what has been a truly 2..... Reith series.

The series is called 3..... Freedom, and it began with two lectures by the pro-democracy 4..... Aung San Suu Kyi which had to be smuggled out of Burma, 5..... the realities behind what she had to say about dissent and the 6..... for freedom and democracy.

Eliza Manningham-Buller, who closes the series today, has had the job of 7..... the freedoms that people in democracies are lucky 8..... to enjoy - she was 9..... of Britain's security service MI5. What she has 10..... said about the war on terror, about 11..... and about Iraq has become a

12..... part of the public debate 13.....
by

the 10th anniversary of 9/11 which we have recently
14.....

We look 15..... to equally provocative views on
the broader 16..... policy questions she plans to address
today. Please welcome the BBC Reith Lecturer for 2011
Eliza Manningham-Buller.

(audience applause)

It's fair to say, Eliza Manningham-Buller, isn't it, that you are
17..... to working in the shadows - at least discreetly -
and 18..... by doing these lectures and by the things that
you've said in the 19..... of the lectures, you've put
20..... very much in the spotlight. Are you
21..... there?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Well the last lecture was in
Leeds, and I had a 22..... the night before where the
cabinet 23..... rang me on a mobile and said, "You mustn't
give this lecture, Eliza". And I said, "Why not?" He said, "You'll
be arrested and 24..... under the Official Secrets Act."
(laughter) And as I very carefully said nothing secret, I woke
up in 25..... a sweat.

EDWARD STOURTON: Does Sir Gus O'Donnell know that he 26..... in your dreams at all? (*audience laughter*)

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Well he doesn't and he never has before. (*audience laughter*)

EDWARD STOURTON: Just making that absolutely clear for the record. Are you aware also that you've 27..... something of a star on Twitter?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Well the BBC was kind enough to give me a printout of Twitter. I don't have a Twitter account, 28..... I've asked one of my grandchildren to sort me out one because I must move into the 21st 29..... And I read all the comments with pleasure, 'til one which said that I sounded like a Sat Nav. (*audience laughter*)

EDWARD STOURTON: Well I think for the 30..... of the audience, let me just share a 31..... of others. I mean firstly, clearly, dogs up and down the land are going un-walked because people are waiting in to hear your lecture. "Can't walk away from my radio" is one that's come to us. You're also 32..... as "awesome" and as "a 33.....

ruling diva”. *(laughs)* I’ll leave that 34..... with you.
Let’s not keep your fans waiting. Eliza Manningham-Buller,
let’s hear your lecture.

(audience applause)

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: In my first lecture I talked
of terrorism, ten years on from 9/11, the fear it 35.....
and its 36..... to our freedom. In my second I talked of
the role of security intelligence in protecting our 37.....
and our freedom. Now I want to consider the 38.....
policy context. I do not do so as an expert in foreign or
domestic policy, but as a retired security intelligence
39.....

In this lecture I want to 40..... that states should,
41..... possible, seek political solutions and
42..... Secondly, that how a nation conducts its
foreign policy has a direct 43..... on its 43.....
of success in the search for conciliation. And finally, I want to
consider how our handling of 44....., and the laws we
pass to deal with it, can 45..... our response to
the threat of terrorism.

In al-Qaeda we see a terrorist grouping with, in many ways, a
medieval ideology, 46..... today’s technology to great
advantage 47..... It works in a
48..... modern way,

virtual, amorphous, franchised and 49..... by geography. It has 50..... people from all over the 51..... It understands the 52..... of images, both in its 53..... of terror and in its recruitment and proselytizing material. It skillfully 54..... the instant communications and 55.

.....networking of the IT age. I think it also understands some of the vulnerability of the West: its appetite for news, its short-termism, its instant 56.....and the 57..... on its governments to respond to terrorism and the limited 58..... open to them.

When I 59..... the security service, there was no internet, international travel was expensive, there was 60. migration, borders were not 61.....porous and communications were usually by a fixed line telephone or a letter. I can remember special kettles being 62.....for steaming open letters. That will no longer 63..... The democratic state can no longer 64..... on its old tools to collect the intelligence it needs to protect itself. It will always 65..... to recruit human 66..... to provide 67..... information, but it also needs, 68..... to proper controls, oversight and legal 69....., to try to redress the 70..... by using the 71.....powerful technologies to react 72..... and to keep it one step 73..... The terrorist now has at

his 74..... tools which were once the
75.....

preserve of the state. He has more 76..... means of conspiring, mobilising and causing 77..... and 78..... So what it is ethical, necessary and 79..... for the state to do in response cannot be set in 80.....

I have known throughout my career that, 81..... professional security and intelligence agencies working with the 82..... may be, and whatever success they may have in preventing terrorist 83....., they can't stop everything. Similarly, however 84..... the terrorists may be, they will suffer attrition, 85....., arrest and imprisonment as well as death.

Success for us will not be the 86..... of terror but less of it, with 87..... deaths and a dwindling 88..... of new recruits. And that success is not 89..... to come from military 90..... or from security, intelligence and police work alone, but from long-term political and economic initiatives 91..... at reducing the causes of terrorism and countering the 92..... ideology in order to seek the peace and reconciliation that has been so 93. in South Africa. Conciliation is never easy, sometimes impossible, but it's always 94. trying. Security and intelligence work can play a 95..... role in creating 96.....

for the political process which is central to that, but it cannot
97..... it.

So what 98..... these political initiatives be? Some of the 99..... may be found in the Arab Spring. This year, 100..... by the self-immolation of a Tunisian street trader, we've seen people in North Africa and the Middle East take to the streets - and sometimes to arms - in protest at the conditions under which they live. The list is long: Tunisia, Algeria, Lebanon, Jordan, Sudan, Oman, Saudi Arabia, Egypt, Syria, Morocco, Yemen, Bahrain, Kuwait and of course Libya.

Conditions in these countries 101..... vary but the protesters have one thing in common, simply 102..... by one of the leaders of the Syrian protesters: "We want what you have - freedom." They are protesting in many cases at venal 103....., at absolute 104....., at lack of human rights, at lack of freedom and association. They also, of course, want jobs, 105..... and education, and some share of the material 106....., which, where it exists, is too 107..... monopolised by their rulers. Their passion for freedom shines out, 108..... by the visibility offered by the internet and promoted by social networks. They are prepared to risk their lives for the freedom we 109.....

The Arab Spring raises 110..... questions about al-

Qaeda's 111..... It has not been able to respond convincingly to the 112..... demand for change, 113..... its adroit use of technology and the media. Al-Qaeda's version of the ideal Islamic government seems to have had little 114.....

The Arab Spring also 115..... shows the hollowness of the 116..... comments I have too often heard, that people 117..... do not want democracy, and with no tradition of it, would not know how to practise it. There were similar patronising comments made about the countries of Eastern Europe when the Soviet Empire 118..... up and the Berlin Wall came down. There is also, among some, an assumption that any government replacing a dictatorship will become corrupt and 119., subject to malign influences. But the fact that democracy often has a 120..... birth means that we should offer 121.....where that is practical.

Our foreign policy must never forget that 122..... for freedom. It must encourage it, both to meet the wishes of those who 123..... it and for our 124..... long-term self-interest. 125..... inevitably short-term interests will intrude. Every now and 126....., governments assert the 127.....for an ethical foreign policy. That laudable 128..... usually bumps up

against the reality that many countries of the world are
129..... by unscrupulous autocrats who use every
130..... to hold on to power. They have little
131..... for the people they govern and often
132..... power only by imprisoning their opponents and
133..... their armed forces. 134..... of these
countries are vital to our economic and security interests.
Unfortunately there is no point talking only to our friends and
135..... The world is a messy place and we need to
136..... with the people in power.

From my own 137..... in the security service, I know that
protecting British citizens would be impossible if we were
restricted to talking to those whose 138..... we share. I
can remember plots to attack us, for example, with
139..... to Indonesia, Somalia, the Philippines,
Kenya, Algeria, Jordan, and, of 140....., most importantly,
Pakistan. That list is not comprehensive. We cannot just talk to
the Swiss however enjoyable and 141..... that might
be.

So what then of the contentious rapprochement with Gaddafi in
2003? I do not think that it was 142..... in principle.
The prize was his abandonment of his programme for nuclear
and chemical weapons. Gaddafi is the man, as I know from
personal experience, who 143..... explosives, arms and
144.....to the Provisional IRA,

indirectly causing the deaths of many of the victims of Irish terrorism, as well as being 145..... himself for a 146..... series of atrocities. They included the murder of the London police officer Yvonne Fletcher and, notably, Lockerbie.

That small Scottish town was 147..... I lived for several weeks, as we and the police tried to 148..... together what had happened and start the 149..... to find the culprits. The people of Lockerbie provided us with generous helpings of home-made food as we began the slow and 150..... investigation to understand why and how 270 people, mainly American students flying home for Christmas, had met their death, and to work 151..... a prosecution of those responsible. I can still see the ashen faces of young service personnel and police officers as they returned to the school, the 152..... police headquarters, after long days searching for body parts and wreckage strewn over a vast 153..... Gaddafi's was a brutal 154..... and his own people suffered most of all.

155. in 2003 the Government made the difficult, but, I think, 156..... decision to open talks. Had Gaddafi made progress with his nuclear and other programmes, he could still be in power today and 157..... us. There are

clearly 158..... to be answered about the various 159..... that developed afterwards and 160..... the UK supped with a sufficiently long spoon. I cannot say 161..... I expect the Gibson Inquiry will address these 162.....

It is right to use all our diplomatic 163..... to encourage dictators to grant their people freedom. For we can surely 164..... that participation in government, the belief at least that you can have some say, however slight, in how you are governed, that people's lives can be 165..... and their rights protected, reduces the need for terrorism.

Look at Northern Ireland, where 166..... terrorists are in government. We should welcome this, not damn it. Look at many of our former colonies, whose first leaders had been 167..... by us for terrorism. Look at Mandela and the ANC which used terror tactics when it was in 168.....

In Northern Ireland, the Provisional IRA decided - partly as a 169..... of intelligence successes against them - that 170..... a parallel policy of terrorism and politics, the armalite and the ballot box, was out-dated and it dropped the gun. The 171..... move from terrorism into government is a long-established 172..... As I said at the end of my

first lecture, I hope that the 173..... freedom which
174..... flow from the Arab Spring will undermine the
attraction of the al-Qaeda narrative. If you are able to engage
in your own political process, you have less 175..... to
attack what across the Arab world is often called the “Great
Satan.”

176....., not only with the dictators of the world but
with the terrorists, is necessary. As Churchill said in the
White House in 1954, “To jaw-jaw is always better than to
war-war”. Intelligence plays an important part and is of most
value if working as part of a wider dialogue involving politics,
177..... and economic process. My most relevant
experience of this is the 178..... and prolonged talks
in Northern Ireland. There are 179..... of other
examples, talking to Hezbollah, to Hamas.

Talking doesn't mean 180..... It means an
181..... to reduce the threat by addressing, if
possible, its causes. It is a way of exploring
182.....options, of probing possibilities, of
identifying whether there is room to 183....., and
what compromises, if any, may be 184....., what
political grievances can be 185..... or even, in rare
cases, accommodated. It is also the opportunity for
governments to express their own positions. It requires
186..... by governments and a

willingness to embark on an 187..... and tricky course which may 188..... prove fruitless.

Not all terrorists are 189..... although their acts are. Nor are they all pathologically violent. A few are but many are not and have their own rationale, not ours, for what they do. In 1994 it was clear that the Provisional IRA was ready to 190..... to proper talks with the British government about the future of Northern Ireland, but, misguidedly, they wished to do so from what they saw as a position of 191..... So shortly before talks were 192..... to start, they dispatched to England a vast bomb concealed in the flat bed of a lorry. It was intercepted and defused, but had it 193....., say in the centre of London, it would have been politically impossible for the government to enter talks, and the peace process would have been 194..... delayed. The Provisional IRA and its political 195....., Sinn Fein, learned greater political sophistication through subsequent engagement.

And what about al-Qaeda? How might we talk to it? And do we even need to? It is not yet clear whether the death of Bin Laden has made the world a 196..... place and whether al-Qaeda has been permanently 197..... The Americans believe, and I obviously have no inside

198....., that he remained the substantive leader of a dispersed organisation, the spider at the middle of the web, and that his death will 199..... the amount of al-Qaeda terrorism we see. I hope they may be right, but webs are resilient and I 200..... that his death will be a fatal blow to the organisation he founded or to the ideology he helped to 201.....

So what is there to 202....., what to negotiate about, what to agree on? Would any concessions be 203.....? I don't know the answers to these questions, but I very much hope that there are those in the West who are 204..... them. We are, after all, talking to the Taliban and may make 205.....

Al-Qaeda is not a 206..... organization with a clear structure. There will be those in al-Qaeda, or associated with its franchises, who are tired and disenchanted, for whom the 207..... has become sterile and sickening. Some, thwarted by lack of success, will be looking for a 208..... out. There are already 209..... prepared to help the West. Bearing in mind that we are 210..... by our deeds, we should also be capable of countering the 211..... of the al-Qaeda narrative - that Islam is 212..... attack from the West.

So we should try to 213..... terrorism by talking to its advocates and practitioners and try to promote freedom 214..... talking to dictators. But we should never forget who and what they are. We need to 215..... helping dictators to survive. The West's record on that is poor. We have too often preferred the stability of the devil we know to the 216..... of democracy. We cannot 217..... people round the world to fail to notice our hypocrisy if a gap exists 218..... our professed support for freedom and our actions. People suffering from oppressive governments are bemused when the West talks of freedom and democracy 219..... at the same time supporting regimes that 220..... them. Of course there may often be much going on behind the scenes and it's important to recognize the real value of quiet diplomacy and private pressure 221..... from the glare of public criticism.

If we 222..... are to be free, and to feel secure in our freedom, it's important to keep a 223..... perspective on terrorist risk. Bin Laden must have known that 9/11 would make this 234..... difficult, for at least two reasons: the endless 235.....of the horror, recycled and replayed round the clock by the 24 236..... media, and the unrealistic view that society can become risk free. The world is full of risks

and 237....., only some of which can be reduced.

Why then, when we in this country know that, for
238....., hospital-acquired infections and road traffic
accidents both kill 239..... more than terrorism, do we
240..... as we do? The threat of violent death is potent. It
can create community tension, 241..... irrational
Islamophobia, and cause loss of confidence in government, as
in Spain after the train bombings in Madrid in 2004. It also
places on 242..... the tough dilemma of providing an
authoritative response without giving the terrorists the status
they seek.

One of the 243..... since 9/11 is that it or something similar
could happen again. And of course it still could, although I
would hope that the substantial investment in security and
intelligence in the last ten years has made it less
244..... It nearly happened with the plot to bring down
up to a 245..... transatlantic aircraft in 2006. Had that
246....., the death toll would have been very high, the
economic cost 247..... and the long term effect
frightening.

248..... in my second lecture that, while it was
government's responsibility to do what it could to protect its
citizens from threats, governments should never 249.

..... that they were able to do so
250..... Politicians lose their way

if they become too apprehensive about how the media will react to terrorism when it 251..... It is very difficult for governments to 252..... both economies that are shaken by terrorism and anxious public opinion. And there are no military or security options that are certain of 253.....

And not all security risks, such as that from a xenophobic, right-wing Norwegian who 254..... to have acted alone, can be anticipated and countered.

255....., political and media pressure to “do something” in response to such 256..... can lead to unnecessary, even counter-productive initiatives and new 257....., which may offer 258..... assurance that they will prevent the recurrence of the event which triggered them.

This is not a new 259..... When the security service was 260..... on Irish-related terrorism, it became used to being 261..... for suggestions for new legislation. There have been times when the service has argued 262..... for legislation, for example for that governing its functions and its powers. But it has 263..... argued for substantial counter-terrorist powers, 264..... the criminal law to be broadly adequate.

Certainly rushing to legislate in the 265..... of a terrorist

atrocities are often a 266..... It may be a well-intentioned mistake, designed to make us safer, but it would be better to reflect on the long term 267..... of what may look 268..... appealing. Since 9/11 there has been a slew of counter-terrorist legislation, some of it helpful, some of it justified as exceptional, partly because of the “War on Terror” 269..... Quite rightly it has been scrutinized by 270..... and the courts and some of it amended. Laws which involve reducing people’s rights can themselves 271..... the public. “Should I be afraid,” the citizen asks, “if the government feels these measures are necessary?”

What terrorism does is frighten us through its random effect and 272..... us from behaving normally. But we compound the problem of terrorism if we use it as a reason to erode the freedom of us all. That is why I 273..... out against the proposal to detain terrorists without charge for up to 42 days (90 had been originally proposed). We were to give up 274..... of value, in effect the principle of habeas corpus, and for what? Some greater spurious security? We must recognise the limits of what any government can do and be deeply 275..... of anything that leads to security being seen as the 276..... of liberty rather than essential to it. Governments should 277..... to limit and reduce the threat of terrorism, encourage its causes to

be 278..... and addressed, protect what it can, and be ready to 279..... with calm when it happens, reasserting our belief in our freedoms and the rule of law.

And, as I hope I have made clear in this talk, governments need to 280..... a foreign policy that, while acknowledging the world as it is, 281..... to secure freedom for others - and to 282..... a domestic policy that protects the liberties we value and which the terrorist tries to destroy.

(audience applause)

EDWARD STOURTON: Eliza Manningham-Buller, thank you very much indeed. If no-one else asks the question about the clever kettles that steamed open envelopes, I'm afraid I'm not going to be able to resist the temptation. But we've got an extremely high-powered audience here who I'm sure have got 283..... questions on their minds, so let's throw this open to the audience and I'll take a question just there.

MAAJID NAWAZ: My name is Maajid Nawaz. I co-founded and 284..... run the Quilliam Foundation. My question is simply what is the relationship between human 285..... and security, and do you think there is a

relationship? How important is that relationship if there is one?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I do not see that liberty and freedom and security are 286..... opposites. I'm quite often asked to speak for one against the other. I refuse to do that. If you look at the European Convention of Human Rights, I think it's Article III, it's the right to liberty and security. They're different, but there's no liberty without security. And I think that my view on 287..... I think has been 288..... widely reported - that it's never justified even if it might save lives.

EDWARD STOURTON: Lots of hands going up. I'm going to take a couple in the front row first. Yes?

JONATHAN POWELL: Jonathan Powell, a former 289..... on Northern Ireland and now working with an NGO doing conflict resolution elsewhere. Eliza, I totally 290.....with what you said about the need for governments to talk to al-Qaeda and to the Taliban, but are there any groups you wouldn't talk to such as the dissident IRA and are there any practical lessons you 291..... from the way we handled negotiations in Northern Ireland?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I think there are
292..... I think it's very difficult politically sometimes for
governments to make the first move; and using intelligence
services that are sort of 293..... to make the first
contacts or to 294..... out I think is an advantage that
keeps the government as it were back from it 295..... they
can properly engage. I think that's quite a good precedent.
Your first question was "were there any people you might not
try to talk to?". Well there's quite obviously a number of people
who'd 296..... to talk to you. And I'm not naïve about al-
Qaeda - I mean I don't see or hear it 297..... up at a
conference table any time soon. I think there are components
you could talk to. And I wouldn't 298..... the dissidents. If
we could talk to the dissident Republicans in Northern Ireland
who are prolonging the conflict there when most of the citizens
of Northern Ireland are very much enjoying the
299..... of peace, I think we should do so.

EDWARD STOURTON: Can I in that context just ask you to
parse a 300..... in your lecture? You said "my most
recent..."

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: (*over*) I was an English

301....., but I ...

EDWARD STOURTON: (over) Well no, no no - you'll quickly see what I'm 302..... at. You said "my most relevant experience of this is the complex" - the ideas you've just been talking about - "is the complex and prolonged talks with Northern Ireland, but there are 303..... of other examples - talking to Hezbollah, to Hamas." Do I take it from that, that MI5 has 304..... been talking to Hamas at a time when our government has not?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: No, I haven't. Can I just 305..... you, I left office four and a half years ago, since when I haven't seen one classified bit of information except when preparing for the Chilcot Inquiry. I believe talks are going on and I'm not going to say more 306..... that.

EDWARD STOURTON: Alright. Down here.

OLIVER McTERNAN: Oliver McTernan, director of Forward Thinking. What I'd like to know is what 307..... would you use to 308..... what may be described as legitimate acts of 309..... and 310..... acts of terrorism?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I don't make
311..... distinctions. I mean I've always tried to
avoid in my 312..... the long debate about freedom
313..... versus terrorist because you go round
in circles on it. You could go on forever
314..... about it.

ROBERT BROWN: Yes, thank you. My name is Robert
Brown. I'm a lawyer. You referred to Irish terrorism. In the 70s
and 315..... people in Ireland regarded then as
freedom fighters, as protestors, committed atrocities involving
the 316..... of thousands of people. They have now
been awarded 317..... as part of a reconciliation
process. How is it that people that committed such atrocities
can be 318..... a complete amnesty, can now
319..... freely in any occupation or even in
government, but protestors in this country - and I'm referring
just for example to the student protests 320..... -
people accused of throwing a couple of sticks at a policeman
are now in prison for a year or 321..... and they will
never have an amnesty? What about an amnesty in this
country for people who make mistakes?

EDWARD STOURTON: Alright, we've got the question.

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Let's 322..... ourselves of the facts in Northern Ireland. Plenty of people were convicted of criminal 323..... and terrorist offences and served long sentences. Now as part of the peace process, many of them were 324..... from prison. Now you might think that I, who had been part of (in very many cases) putting them 325..... bars in the first place for murder, might feel pretty disgusted by the fact that they were released, but it was part of the 326....., wider process. And if I can just say something more on Northern Ireland. I think there's lots of people who should be very much 327..... for what they work - the politicians, but also the political parties within Northern Ireland. If Ian Paisley, for example, had felt like you had and had not sat down with Martin McGuinness, we would still have terrorism in Northern Ireland. So 328..... were made, but the 329..... was the greater peace that now prevails in the province, with the 330. of some of the activity of the dissident groups.

EDWARD STOURTON: Can I just 331..... that up? It's not directly relevant to the question, but it's 332....., easier for you to feel comfortable about the fact that people you helped lock up are now at liberty than it is for the families of their victims, isn't it?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I'm sure that is 333....., and I wouldn't wish at all to minimise the awful suffering the 334..... go through. But I can remember the man whose name I can't remember, but I can remember his 335..... at Enniskillen, when his daughter was killed by a bomb and his 336.....Christian forgiveness and charity. And I think that it obviously requires people to stomach quite a lot in some cases, but if you think about what the alternatives are - prolonged, continuing campaign of terror, which could not be 337..... by military means.

EDWARD STOURTON: Can I, yes, take a question from here?

ANTHONY BEEVOR: Anthony Beevor, historian. You talked I think in a 338..... lecture about the danger of describing the "War on Terror". Would you also agree that the way that governments can tend to overreact by using 339..... historical comparisons - particularly we saw, and in fact my blood almost 340..... when I heard the comparison between Pearl Harbour and 9/11, Blair comparing Saddam Hussein to Hitler just as Eden had compared Nasser to Hitler - do you think that this 341..... is now over of politicians and statesmen making these

False 342..... with the past because really, with the Arab Spring and everything 343....., that things have changed so much?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Of course the danger's not over - politicians have to be re-elected and they have to make speeches. But the "War on Terror" language, which I am uncomfortable with, I was 344..... to see that Donald Rumsfeld shares my view and says that he tried to 345..... George Bush not to use that language. So we have one thing in common. *(audience laughter)*

EDWARD STOURTON: I'm going to go to the other side of the room and take a couple of questions a bit 346..... back. Yes?

KARLA ADAM: Hello, my name is Karla Adam. I'm with the Washington Post. Can I ask your 347..... on American policy in Yemen, which is effectively to contain al-Qaeda through 348..... strikes?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I was 349..... dreading somebody asking me the drone question. *(audience laughter)*

EDWARD STOURTON: It means it's a good question.

Well done.

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Because 350.....

before I retired, there was I think one ... There were very few drone strikes and they've obviously increased very

351..... in the last few years, so my view of them is very

much as it 352..... as a reader of the media. I do think

there are difficulties. I think one of them is obviously the

collateral damage of a lot of 353..... people being killed

by them. However, there's clearly also the fact that a number

of 354..... terrorists have been taken out that way. So if

I'm 355.....really honest, I sway in what I think my view is

on that 356..... technique, which the present President of

the United States has 357..... very extensively.

EDWARD STOURTON: Down here, yeah?

ANAS ALTIKRITI: Yes, thank you very much. My name's Anas

Altikriti. I'm the 358..... executive of the Cordoba

Foundation. I noted that 359..... talking about the

360..... and the threats on a security level, you didn't

associate those threats or those challenges with Islam or

Muslims particularly, but those are 361.....

and they are possibly cross-border. But my question is about the Arab

Spring. Is there a 362..... for us to learn from what's happening? Are we in a 363..... to rethink how we assess in previous 364..... that particular region and those particular people?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Yes, well I think it's 365..... likely that my former friends in the Foreign Office and 366..... government and outside government are doing exactly that because obviously it is teaching us a 367..... amount about what these people in these different countries want, which I think we should have 368..... but which there was this presumption in many cases that they 369..... want democracy.

EDWARD STOURTON: Yup?

NABILA RAMDANI: Nabila Ramdani, freelance journalist. Do you 370..... that the British military assisting popular revolutions in countries like Libya, do you think it ultimately 371..... the risk of terrorism ...

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: (*over*) No.

NABILA RAMDANI: 372..... British interests.

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I don't.

EDWARD STOURTON: That's clear. (*audience laughter*) Do you want to tell us 373.....?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Well I mean I think there's two things here and 374..... I should be a bit more ample in my answer. Our 375..... in Iraq increased the risk of terror here. It's assumed that that was 376..... automatically the wrong thing to do. You might wish as a government to take action in doing something 377..... you thought it was the right thing to do, which would in the short-term increase the terrorist risk. That would not be your only 378..... for making a decision. And I think all I'd say to 379..... to that is I think decisions made by government are pretty tough 380..... There are ministers in the audience and 381..... ministers. You make decisions. I've watched ministers making decisions. They have to make a lot of them. As they make them, they 382..... that most of them are the right decisions. They will know that some of them 383..... be and they make them with the 384..... means they can. Now Iraq I think was a mistake for a number of 385..... I don't think Libya necessarily was. I don't think it automatically leads to more terrorism. It did in Iraq.

EDWARD STOURTON: Since you 386..... ministers, I'm going to come to someone who knows what it's like to be one.

LORD WEST: Lord West, simple sailor. (*audience laughter*) In the Second World War, we had very, very draconian laws passed of course constraining the 387..... to the individual, but we were in a situation where there was an 388..... threat to the United Kingdom. The terrorist threat is very 389.....and not very nice, but it's far from that at the moment. But if we had information that showed that these terrorists did have easy 390..... to or had actually possession of an improvised nuclear 391..... or let's say, for example, some particularly virulent, very nasty thing that we knew would have a terrible 392....., do you believe that the standards of things like interrogation and the standards of 393..... that passed should change, bearing in mind it's an existential threat to our 394..... nation, it's a very different thing?

EDWARD STOURTON: 395..... having poked fun at yourself by calling yourself a simple sailor, you were of course the security minister in the last government, so you know whereof you speak. Yes, go ahead.

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I hope that it wouldn't
396..... the laws. I hope that we wouldn't resort to
torture. It's obviously a hypothetical question. We didn't in the
Second World War; I hope we wouldn't in those
397.....

RIAZAT BUTT: My name's Riazat Butt and I work for the
Guardian. When you're talking about having
398..... with people, and talking doesn't
necessarily mean approval, where does Saudi Arabia figure in
this because it has a very interesting 399..... to
freedom and human rights?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: With dealing with people
who don't have democracy, who don't have human rights, you
want in small ways when you can to 400..... them,
encourage them. They may pay no attention to you. Why
should they? But you have an 401..... to describe
these things and push them.

EDWARD STOURTON: (to audience) I'm going to take a
question over there, but before we take it, I just want to ask
you something. We've heard a lot from Eliza Manningham-
Buller about the 402..... of talking to terrorists. How many
people in this room think that in 403..... that's a
bad idea? Well I'd say you've probably been
404.....

because not a 405..... hand has gone up. Oh one's gone up over there. Well I'm going to take a question just in the 406..... in front of you and then I'll come to you and find out why you think that.

OSAMA HUSSEIN: My name's Osama Hussein. I'm an 407..... and an academic. I'd like to also thank you very much for your lecture. Regarding the difficulties in talking to al-Qaeda, over the 408..... ten years it's become clear that 409..... of Westerners have been recruited into al-Qaeda and many have 410.....left that path and are working against it. And, for example, after 9/11 al-Qaeda tried to recruit me (I 411..... to Saudi Arabia and talked to a couple of their people) and you'll be glad to know I said "no, I don't want to be a part of your work". But the point is al-Qaeda was at the time 412..... in Afghanistan, but 413..... and ideologically they were based clearly in Saudi Arabia and also in Pakistan and other places. Surely we have those 414..... now and we should be making use of those channels to talk to the clerics and the leaders who promote the al-Qaeda ideology because we have links with them here in the West?

EDWARD STOURTON: So just to be clear, your argument is talk to the people who proselytize the ideology 415.....

than talking to the 416.....? Is that what you're suggesting?

OSAMA HUSSEIN: Well it seems to me we have not done 417..... of that - of talking to the theological leaders, including the ones here in the West.

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I think that's a fair point, it's a fair point. To go back to Saudi Arabia, I mean they have a very interesting programme of 418..... to rehabilitate former Jihadis, not by 419..... them of their human rights but by the opposite actually - by religious education and so on - which is 420..... interesting.

EDWARD STOURTON: Can I, 421..... we're talking about the question of talking to al-Qaeda, just 422..... one issue with you. A lot of people would say that there's a distinction between a group like al-Qaeda, which doesn't have a 423..... agenda, and a group like the IRA which does, or even actually the Taliban, which after all was 424..... a government. It's very difficult to see how you would begin the conversation with al-Qaeda, isn't it?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: You're 425..... right. With Northern Ireland, we 426..... what the agenda was and

it was a question of whether you could move any way
427..... it. 428..... of course the
declared aims of al-Qaeda, some of them simply are never
going to be 429..... and we would have strong
objections to that sort of oppressive regime that they support.
But I'm really ... I'm not suggesting we 430..... off and
do this tomorrow. I am suggesting, and I hope and I wouldn't
be surprised if it's happening, that people are thinking about
which components, which franchises, which bits you could
seek to 431..... off from the main body of the 432.....
by talking to them.

EDWARD STOURTON: So you're not actually talking
about a negotiation with a political 433..... in
view?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: (*over*) Oh nothing ...

EDWARD STOURTON: (*over*) You're talking about trying to
434..... the organisation if you like?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: (*over*) Talking, reaching the
solution in Northern Ireland took 435..... years. This
isn't going to happen 436..... or soon.

EDWARD STOURTON: Well let's hear from the

gentleman who's the brave 437.....I who was the one who put up his hand and said he thought that talking to terrorists was, in 438....., a bad idea.

JIM MOORE: Jim Moore. Actually your question was very much my 439..... - is that I would find it very hard to actually think that you were talking to al-Qaeda for any reason other than to splinter off people, to 440..... with al-Qaeda.

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: What about their first aim - the 441..... of American bases from Saudi Arabia?

EDWARD STOURTON: That should be on the table, in your 442.....?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I don't know. You could have it on the table.

EDWARD STOURTON: (*over/laughs*) But you raise it as if it should be.

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Yes. I mean that is something that you 443..... could move on.

JIM MOORE: I just cannot fathom a 444..... with the core folks in al-Qaeda on the basis of 445.....their first ... 446..... their first thing is you know what will we serve at the table when we talk?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I'm not 447..... that anybody's going to talk to al-Zawahiri.

EDWARD STOURTON: But just for the record, we should understand from what you said that American 448..... on Arab soil, on Islamic soil, is something that you can 449..... being a subject of genuine negotiation?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I would have thought so.

EDWARD STOURTON: Going to hear a question in the second row there. But before I do, do you mind if I just ask you the kettle question?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Yes.

EDWARD STOURTON: I mean it's just such an intriguing thought. What's special about these kettles?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: There's nothing
450..... They were very big. (*audience
laughter*)

EDWARD STOURTON: And they sort of sat on the stove and
...?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: They just 451.....
a lot of steam. (*audience laughter*)

EDWARD STOURTON: So a lot of letters had to be
opened?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: In those days, yes.

EDWARD STOURTON: It's very childish of me. I
452..... Let's take a more serious question from
down here.

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: (*over*) But I didn't do it
because it would have 453..... my hair go frizzy.
(*audience laughter*)

XENIA DORMANDY: Thank you. Xenia Dormandy from
Chatham House. Back in 2004, Condi Rice gave a
454..... in Egypt where she said - and I'm
paraphrasing - that "no

455..... will America put security and stability
456..... of freedoms and democracy”. It’s not the first
time an American has said that, and I think she would agree
with many of your statements, which are “you have to have a
balance”. Back to the Saudi Arabia question, particularly from
the American perspective - Saudi Arabia’s long been a good
friend of the United States - where do you find that balance
whereby, as you say, promoting, talking to (if it’s the Saudis or
any other government) about freedom is
457.....while actually still supporting their stability
for your own country? How do you 458..... that balance
and what kind of criteria would you use?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I don’t 459.....
that balance is easy to find. Obviously Saudi Arabia has been
a good friend to the West. We rely on its oil. We shouldn’t
460..... that to make us blind to the nature of the
government. My hope would be that when there’s a new
generation of Saudi rulers, that persuasion, pressure from the
West, there may be some greater freedom given to their
461..... for their own self-interest. I mean let’s not forget
where the 9/11 bombers came from. These were men who
were 462..... from Saudi Arabia where they had
no freedom. I would argue that the long-term security of Saudi
Arabia 463..... giving greater freedom to the

citizenry, greater share in the material 464....., and leading to a much more stable system than is 465.....the case.

KIM HOWELLS: Kim Howells, a retired Foreign Office Minister. I may be wrong, but I think the last 466..... of terrorism in Britain was Mr Litvinenko. What do we do about the new forms of terrorism, which we know about 467..... - some of them cyber terrorism aimed to 468..... or do damage to parts of our economy - that are centred in countries like Russia and China? Doesn't this come right to the 469..... of your original premise about how foreign policy has to be abreast of these 470..... in the world and has to 471..... try to accommodate them?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I don't think there's a simple answer. I mean there's a lot of work going on 472....., and it's a difficult problem because we all want to have the 473..... access that information technology gives us. You know all politicians want their Blackberries. Greater 474..... and economy arrives from IT - sometimes - and that gives our enemies 475..... opportunities to do a number of things. They can suck secrets out of British companies, of government departments - I mean

there are thousands and thousands of attacks on the
Pentagon 476..... day - suck things out,

distort material that's already there or 477..... service. I know that a lot of work in government is going on this.

EDWARD STOURTON: Can I, yes, take a question from here?

ALEXANDR KHOMENKO: Yes, thank you very much. Alexandr Khomenko of the 478..... Embassy. *(audience laughter)* When you tried to 479..... the threat of international terrorism, let's say ten years ago, did you try to 480.....lessons from European terrorism 481..... to the outbreak of the First World War?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: No.

ALEXANDR KHOMENKO: You didn't? Fine.

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: The First World War, you said?

ALEXANDR KHOMENKO: *(over)* Yes 482..... the First World War, yes.

EDWARD STOURTON: *(over)* You're talking about anarchist bombers in St. Petersburg and so forth?

ALEXANDR KHOMENKO: Yes. And the second one is do you think that the threat of international terrorism coming from the Arab East is 483..... because of the Arab Spring – 484..... through the participation in civil 485..... or participation in open democratic process?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I would hope that the answer to that second question is yes. Can I 486.....that when you next have guests to the Lubyanka, you install a ladies cloakroom? (**audience laughter**)

EDWARD STOURTON: A priceless moment of international 487..... Let me just ...

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: I much enjoyed my visit there, but there was no Ladies.

EDWARD STOURTON: Can I just ask you a final question? I teased you a bit 488..... about the fact that you've become rather a star 489..... these lectures. There was a half serious thought behind that. I think one of the things that people have been 490..... by during these lectures is that while these 491.....

were going on inside government about Iraq, about the use
of 492..... and so

forth, we on the 493..... had no sense of that debate and we've heard you express very strong views on these questions. If we had a system a bit more like the Americans, say, where the head of a service like yours, say like the 494..... - a very public figure, somebody who can participate in the public debate - do you think you might have been 495..... to make some of these points in public when you were serving and might it have been a good thing if you 496.....?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: Well I think I'm still too much in my bones a 497..... servant - to believe it's the duty of public servants to give 498..... to ministers in private and to be 499.....about what that advice has been. How else can ministers make these very difficult 500..... that they have to make on decisions? I did actually say in 2006 that I thought that our going ... I said in a public speech, with the permission of the Home Secretary, that I 501..... that the war in Iraq had increased the 502..... of some young British Muslims. So I did say it when I was still in office. I mean whatever form of accountability happens with the agencies - if Parliament 503..... that you know my successor gives 504..... in public, that's for Parliament to decide. But I suppose I would feel uncomfortable while I was in office displaying publicly if I had 505..... with

ministers at the time.

EDWARD STOURTON: You remain a good old-fashioned MI5
506..... servant, spy?

ELIZA MANNINGHAM-BULLER: A good old-fashioned
public servant, I think.

EDWARD STOURTON: Well there we must sadly end it. My
507..... to those of you who wanted to ask questions and
couldn't. Our thanks to all our 508..... and indeed to our
host, the British Library, but above all our thanks to Eliza
Manningham-Buller for a truly engrossing series of lectures
that I 509.....are going to be discussed long after we leave
this hall. I'm Edward Stourton and the producers were Jim
Frank and Mark Savage.

(audience applause)